



Province of Alberta

The 29th Legislature  
Fourth Session

# Alberta Hansard

Wednesday afternoon, April 18, 2018

Day 19

The Honourable Robert E. Wanner, Speaker

## Legislative Assembly of Alberta The 29th Legislature

### Fourth Session

Wanner, Hon. Robert E., Medicine Hat (NDP), Speaker  
Jabbour, Deborah C., Peace River (NDP), Deputy Speaker and Chair of Committees  
Sweet, Heather, Edmonton-Manning (NDP), Deputy Chair of Committees

Aheer, Leela Sharon, Chestermere-Rocky View (UCP),  
Deputy Leader of the Official Opposition  
Anderson, Hon. Shaye, Leduc-Beaumont (NDP)  
Anderson, Wayne, Highwood (UCP)  
Babcock, Erin D., Stony Plain (NDP)  
Barnes, Drew, Cypress-Medicine Hat (UCP)  
Bilous, Hon. Deron, Edmonton-Beverly-Clareview (NDP)  
Carlier, Hon. Oneil, Whitecourt-St. Anne (NDP)  
Carson, Jonathon, Edmonton-Meadowlark (NDP)  
Ceci, Hon. Joe, Calgary-Fort (NDP)  
Clark, Greg, Calgary-Elbow (AP),  
Alberta Party Opposition House Leader  
Connolly, Michael R.D., Calgary-Hawkwood (NDP)  
Coolahan, Craig, Calgary-Klein (NDP)  
Cooper, Nathan, Olds-Didsbury-Three Hills (UCP)  
Cortes-Vargas, Estefania, Strathcona-Sherwood Park (NDP),  
Government Whip  
Cyr, Scott J., Bonnyville-Cold Lake (UCP)  
Dach, Lorne, Edmonton-McClung (NDP)  
Dang, Thomas, Edmonton-South West (NDP)  
Drever, Deborah, Calgary-Bow (NDP)  
Drysdale, Wayne, Grande Prairie-Wapiti (UCP)  
Eggen, Hon. David, Edmonton-Calder (NDP)  
Ellis, Mike, Calgary-West (UCP)  
Feehan, Hon. Richard, Edmonton-Rutherford (NDP),  
Deputy Government House Leader  
Fildebrandt, Derek Gerhard, Strathmore-Brooks (Ind)  
Fitzpatrick, Maria M., Lethbridge-East (NDP)  
Fraser, Rick, Calgary-South East (AP)  
Ganley, Hon. Kathleen T., Calgary-Buffalo (NDP),  
Deputy Government House Leader  
Gill, Prab, Calgary-Greenway (UCP),  
Official Opposition Deputy Whip  
Goehring, Nicole, Edmonton-Castle Downs (NDP)  
Gotfried, Richard, Calgary-Fish Creek (UCP)  
Gray, Hon. Christina, Edmonton-Mill Woods (NDP)  
Hanson, David B., Lac La Biche-St. Paul-Two Hills (UCP)  
Hinkley, Bruce, Wetaskiwin-Camrose (NDP)  
Hoffman, Hon. Sarah, Edmonton-Glenora (NDP)  
Horne, Trevor A.R., Spruce Grove-St. Albert (NDP)  
Hunter, Grant R., Cardston-Taber-Warner (UCP)  
Jansen, Hon. Sandra, Calgary-North West (NDP)  
Kazim, Anam, Calgary-Glenmore (NDP)  
Kenney, Hon. Jason, PC, Calgary-Lougheed (UCP),  
Leader of the Official Opposition  
Kleinstauber, Jamie, Calgary-Northern Hills (NDP)  
Larivee, Hon. Danielle, Lesser Slave Lake (NDP),  
Deputy Government House Leader  
Littlewood, Jessica, Fort Saskatchewan-Vegreville (NDP)

Loewen, Todd, Grande Prairie-Smoky (UCP)  
Loyola, Rod, Edmonton-Ellerslie (NDP)  
Luff, Robyn, Calgary-East (NDP)  
Malkinson, Brian, Calgary-Currie (NDP)  
Mason, Hon. Brian, Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood (NDP),  
Government House Leader  
McCuaig-Boyd, Hon. Margaret,  
Dunvegan-Central Peace-Notley (NDP)  
McIver, Ric, Calgary-Hays (UCP),  
Official Opposition Whip  
McKitrick, Annie, Sherwood Park (NDP)  
McLean, Hon. Stephanie V., Calgary-Varsity (NDP)  
McPherson, Karen M., Calgary-Mackay-Nose Hill (AP)  
Miller, Barb, Red Deer-South (NDP)  
Miranda, Hon. Ricardo, Calgary-Cross (NDP)  
Nielsen, Christian E., Edmonton-Decore (NDP)  
Nixon, Jason, Rimbey-Rocky Mountain House-Sundre (UCP),  
Official Opposition House Leader  
Notley, Hon. Rachel, Edmonton-Strathcona (NDP),  
Premier  
Orr, Ronald, Lacombe-Ponoka (UCP)  
Panda, Prasad, Calgary-Foothills (UCP)  
Payne, Hon. Brandy, Calgary-Acadia (NDP)  
Phillips, Hon. Shannon, Lethbridge-West (NDP)  
Piquette, Colin, Athabasca-Sturgeon-Redwater (NDP)  
Pitt, Angela D., Airdrie (UCP),  
Official Opposition Deputy House Leader  
Renaud, Marie F., St. Albert (NDP)  
Rosendahl, Eric, West Yellowhead (NDP)  
Sabir, Hon. Irfan, Calgary-McCall (NDP)  
Schmidt, Hon. Marlin, Edmonton-Gold Bar (NDP)  
Schneider, David A., Little Bow (UCP)  
Schreiner, Kim, Red Deer-North (NDP)  
Shepherd, David, Edmonton-Centre (NDP)  
Sigurdson, Hon. Lori, Edmonton-Riverview (NDP)  
Smith, Mark W., Drayton Valley-Devon (UCP)  
Starke, Dr. Richard, Vermilion-Lloydminster (PC)  
Stier, Pat, Livingstone-Macleod (UCP)  
Strankman, Rick, Drumheller-Stettler (UCP)  
Sucha, Graham, Calgary-Shaw (NDP)  
Swann, Dr. David, Calgary-Mountain View (AL)  
Taylor, Wes, Battle River-Wainwright (UCP)  
Turner, Dr. A. Robert, Edmonton-Whitemud (NDP)  
van Dijken, Glenn, Barrhead-Morinville-Westlock (UCP)  
Westhead, Cameron, Banff-Cochrane (NDP),  
Deputy Government Whip  
Woollard, Denise, Edmonton-Mill Creek (NDP)  
Yao, Tany, Fort McMurray-Wood Buffalo (UCP)  
Vacant, Fort McMurray-Conklin  
Vacant, Innisfail-Sylvan Lake

### Party standings:

New Democratic: 54   United Conservative: 25   Alberta Party: 3   Alberta Liberal: 1   Progressive Conservative: 1   Independent: 1   Vacant: 2

### Officers and Officials of the Legislative Assembly

Robert H. Reynolds, QC, Clerk	Philip Massolin, Manager of Research and	Brian G. Hodgson, Sergeant-at-Arms
Shannon Dean, Law Clerk and Director of	Committee Services	Chris Caughell, Deputy Sergeant-at-Arms
House Services	Nancy Robert, Research Officer	Paul Link, Assistant Sergeant-at-Arms
Stephanie LeBlanc, Senior Parliamentary	Janet Schwegel, Managing Editor of	Gareth Scott, Assistant Sergeant-at-Arms
Counsel	<i>Alberta Hansard</i>	
Trafton Koenig, Parliamentary Counsel		

### **Executive Council**

Rachel Notley	Premier, President of Executive Council
Sarah Hoffman	Deputy Premier, Minister of Health
Shaye Anderson	Minister of Municipal Affairs
Deron Bilous	Minister of Economic Development and Trade
Oneil Carlier	Minister of Agriculture and Forestry
Joe Ceci	President of Treasury Board and Minister of Finance
David Eggen	Minister of Education
Richard Feehan	Minister of Indigenous Relations
Kathleen T. Ganley	Minister of Justice and Solicitor General
Christina Gray	Minister of Labour, Minister Responsible for Democratic Renewal
Sandra Jansen	Minister of Infrastructure
Danielle Larivee	Minister of Children's Services
Brian Mason	Minister of Transportation
Margaret McCuaig-Boyd	Minister of Energy
Stephanie V. McLean	Minister of Service Alberta, Minister of Status of Women
Ricardo Miranda	Minister of Culture and Tourism
Brandy Payne	Associate Minister of Health
Shannon Phillips	Minister of Environment and Parks, Minister Responsible for the Climate Change Office
Irfan Sabir	Minister of Community and Social Services
Marlin Schmidt	Minister of Advanced Education
Lori Sigurdson	Minister of Seniors and Housing

### **Parliamentary Secretaries**

Jessica Littlewood	Economic Development and Trade for Small Business
Annie McKittrick	Education

## STANDING AND SPECIAL COMMITTEES OF THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ALBERTA

### **Standing Committee on the Alberta Heritage Savings Trust Fund**

Chair: Mr. Coolahan  
Deputy Chair: Mrs. Schreiner

Clark	Horne
Cyr	McKitrick
Dang	Turner
Ellis	

### **Standing Committee on Alberta's Economic Future**

Chair: Mr. Sucha  
Deputy Chair: Mr. van Dijken

Carson	Littlewood
Clark	Piquette
Connolly	Schneider
Coolahan	Schreiner
Dach	Starke
Fitzpatrick	Taylor
Gotfried	

### **Standing Committee on Families and Communities**

Chair: Ms Goehring  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Smith

Drever	Miller
Ellis	Orr
Hinkley	Renaud
Horne	Shepherd
Luff	Swann
McKitrick	Yao
McPherson	

### **Standing Committee on Legislative Offices**

Chair: Mr. Shepherd  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Malkinson

Aheer	Littlewood
Drever	Pitt
Gill	van Dijken
Horne	Woollard
Kleinsteuber	

### **Special Standing Committee on Members' Services**

Chair: Mr. Wanner  
Deputy Chair: Cortes-Vargas

Cooper	Nixon
Dang	Piquette
Jabbour	Pitt
Luff	Schreiner
McIver	

### **Standing Committee on Private Bills**

Chair: Ms Kazim  
Deputy Chair: Connolly

Anderson, W.	Orr
Babcock	Rosendahl
Drever	Stier
Drysdale	Strankman
Hinkley	Sucha
Kleinsteuber	Taylor
McKitrick	

### **Standing Committee on Privileges and Elections, Standing Orders and Printing**

Chair: Ms Fitzpatrick  
Deputy Chair: Ms Babcock

Carson	Loyola
Coolahan	Miller
Cooper	Nielsen
Goehring	Nixon
Gotfried	Pitt
Hanson	van Dijken
Kazim	

### **Standing Committee on Public Accounts**

Chair: Mr. Cyr  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Dach

Barnes	Malkinson
Carson	Miller
Fildebrandt	Nielsen
Gotfried	Panda
Hunter	Renaud
Littlewood	Turner
Luff	

### **Standing Committee on Resource Stewardship**

Chair: Loyola  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Drysdale

Babcock	Malkinson
Dang	McPherson
Fraser	Nielsen
Hanson	Rosendahl
Kazim	Woollard
Kleinsteuber	Vacant
Loewen	

## Legislative Assembly of Alberta

1:30 p.m.

Wednesday, April 18, 2018

[The Speaker in the chair]

### Prayers

**The Speaker:** Good afternoon, everyone. It's a beautiful day out there. It's about time.

Hon. members, let us each in our own way reflect or pray. As we come together today for another day of thoughtful and considered deliberation, let us acknowledge that today we gather on Treaty 6 territory, a traditional gathering place for diverse indigenous peoples, and we give thanks for the contributions they have made to our province. Let us affirm our common commitment to enhance the lives of all those who call Alberta home and continue the pursuit of the common good.

Please be seated.

### Introduction of Visitors

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Economic Development and Trade.

**Mr. Bilous:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I rise to introduce to you and through you to all members of the Assembly the ambassador of Germany to Canada, Her Excellency Sabine Sparwasser, as well as Mr. Harald Kuckertz, honorary consul of Germany in Edmonton, and Mr. Hubertus Liebrecht, honorary consul of Germany in Calgary. Her Excellency's visit has offered Alberta and Germany the opportunity to discuss how to build on our strong relationship. There's enormous potential for our two jurisdictions to expand bilateral trade and collaborate, especially with the Canada-EU comprehensive economic and trade agreement now provisionally applied. We look forward to working with Her Excellency to further develop and strengthen our relationship with Germany. I see that my guests have risen. I would now ask the Assembly to give them the traditional warm welcome.

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

### Introduction of Guests

**The Speaker:** Again the hon. Minister of Economic Development and Trade.

**Mr. Bilous:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. It's my pleasure to rise and introduce to you and through you to all members of the Assembly a number of incredibly sharp students that come from Overlanders elementary school in the riding of Edmonton-Beverly-Clareview. The students are accompanied by Sherry Germain, Robin Murphy, Kayla Nabe as well as by a number of chaperones: Melissa Schneider, Tracy Allen, Tim Martinez, Chad and Shelley Forsberg. I'd now ask them all to rise and receive the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly and for us to greet them and welcome them to our building.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

The hon. Member for Lac La Biche-St. Paul-Two Hills.

**Mr. Hanson:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. It's my pleasure to stand and introduce to you and through you students from l'école Beauséjour. I apologize to the students. I have a choice of doing this

in English or French, and I'm going to choose English. With them are their teachers, Karen Levoir and Marilynne Blais, as well as chaperones Tracy Lord and Jason Bourassa. If they could all please rise and receive the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

The hon. Member for Fort Saskatchewan-Vegreville.

**Mrs. Littlewood:** Thank you so much, Mr. Speaker. It's my absolute privilege to introduce to you and through you the students, teachers, and chaperones from SouthPointe school in Fort Saskatchewan. We have 41 students with us here today with their teachers, Mr. Tyler Nyznyx, Mrs. Nikki Hammel, Mrs. Jordana Cohan, and chaperones Mr. Robert Marshall, Mr. Chris Smith, Mrs. Tracey Marshall, and Mrs. Jamie Nelson. SouthPointe school is the first school that has been built in Fort Saskatchewan in 35 years, for a city whose population has doubled, so I'm proud to introduce the first year of our students here in our Legislature today. I'd ask everyone to extend the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome

The hon. Member for Calgary-Bow.

**Drever:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It is my pleasure to introduce to you and through you to all members a team from the University of Calgary who recently made an extraordinary achievement. DUO Collegare won a prestigious computer science competition called VHacks, which is a global hackathon competition organized by the Vatican to encourage interfaith dialogue and foster social inclusion across the globe. This talented team, coached by Dr. Bob Schulz and Megha Chopra, developed an innovative solution to the interfaith dialogue theme and won two awards against students from many of the world's best-known universities. You certainly made Alberta proud. Here today we have Sharon Wang, Raza Qazi, Eric Eidelberg, Sasha Ivanov. Francis Duahn is not here today. I thank the team for their contributions to making a peaceful difference in the world and ask them to now rise to receive the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome

The hon. Minister of Agriculture and Forestry.

**Mr. Carlier:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It's my sincere pleasure to introduce to you and through you to all members of the Assembly the town of Whitecourt Youth Advisory Committee. Twelve members of the youth advisory committee are with us today, accompanied by Mayor Maryann Chichak and staff of the town. This group of young citizens works with the town council to ensure that the needs and voice of community youth is heard. They are responsible for promoting awareness of youth services and programs in their schools. I would like them now to rise and receive the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

The hon. Member for Sherwood Park.

**Ms McKittrick:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It is my pleasure to introduce to you and through you to all members of the Assembly guests from the Edmonton and Area Land Trust. This year the Edmonton and Area Land Trust celebrates its 10th anniversary of conserving natural areas. The trust has secured 12 natural areas, including Golden Ranches and Hicks in Strathcona county. Here today are the executive director, Pam Wight, and directors Alex Nagy and Douwe Vanderwel, who is joined today by his wife, Wendy. I thank my guests for their commitment to preserving

natural areas in our region and ask them to now rise and receive the warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

The hon. Member for Airdrie.

**Mrs. Pitt:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It's an honour and a pleasure to rise today to introduce to you and through you to all members of this Assembly two of Airdrie's newest residents, business owners Pamela Jarosz and Cody Fitzsimmons. Would you please rise. Pamela and Cody own Airdrie's first and only brewery, called Fitzsimmons Brewing, and they recently won an award, which is very rare for a first-year brewery, for East Lake Amber beer, which you can find on tap here in Edmonton at Beer Revolution. Give it a try. I highly recommend it. Please greet them with the traditional warm welcome of this Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

The hon. Minister of Service Alberta and of Status of Women.

**Ms McLean:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I am very pleased to rise today and introduce to you and through you to all members of this Assembly a number of employees from Service Alberta. Later today I will be tabling legislation that will better protect utility consumers, and it's because of the very hard work of our exceptional ministry staff that I'm able to table that legislation. I want to say to them: thank you very much for all of your hard work on this important issue. I'd like to ask the team to rise as I call out individual names, and I'd ask all members of the House to please join me in welcoming my guests. I apologize in advance to any of them if I mispronounce their names. First up is Chris Hunt, the executive director of the Utilities Consumer Advocate – Chris, if you could rise; I can't see you behind the pole, but I'm sure you're there – with Naina Jairath, Nola Ruzycski, Jeff Morton, Eli Mirton-Tamakloe, Agatha Grochowski, Patrece Walker, and Laurel Van De Keere. If we could all please give them the warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

The hon. Minister of Health and Deputy Premier.

**Ms Hoffman:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. It's my pleasure to introduce some members of the Alberta Health team who are here today. They're from the health information systems branch, and they are seated in the public gallery. April is Records and Information Management Month. Almost everything that is done in Health creates a record, and it's important to manage these records so that we can find important information when we need it. I'm proud to recognize the work that they do behind the scenes to support the health care system in making life better for Albertans. Now welcome Kim Wieringa, the ADM; Cathy Simpson, director, enterprise content management; and Jia Zhu, corporate records manager. Please stand and receive the warm welcome of our Assembly.

1:40

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

The hon. Member for Edmonton-South West.

**Mr. Dang:** Thank you. It's my privilege today to rise to introduce to you and through you to all members of the Assembly somebody who should be familiar to yourself, Mr. Speaker, David Draper. David used to be a page here in the Assembly, serving all the hon. members in this House. He's currently the vice-president of finance at Delta Upsilon, the same fraternity I attended while at the University of Alberta, and he is currently pursuing his political science degree. David is also a strong volunteer in my constituency association and

is here today because he misses watching what an NDP government can do. I see that he's risen, and I'd ask the members to please give him the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome, David.

## Members' Statements

### Taber

**Mr. Hunter:** Mr. Speaker, I'm sure you have heard that right now the people in and around Taber are battling Mother Nature's floods. Over a dozen families have lost the battle and have been evacuated to safety while overland flooding decimates their homes and land. Our hearts and prayers go out to them.

The residents of Taber and Taber county are strong, resilient folk who have in the past and will again rebuild. In the coming days and weeks you will see the community rallying around each other, helping selflessly and generously those who have been devastated. Mr. Speaker, these people have big hearts.

To illustrate this generosity, when I was first elected, in 2015, I was invited to attend a fundraiser for the TANGO Foundation, which stands for Taber Assisting Nations through Global Outreach. Started in 2013, this group of Taber physicians, eye surgeons, dentists, and construction workers has helped almost 8,500 people in third-world countries. Together they have donated almost \$4 million in goods and services. I've often wondered what builds such amazing and caring people. I believe in large measure it is their strong religious roots and their deep connection to the earth through farming.

Taber knows how to kick up their heels and have fun as well, Mr. Speaker. Cornfest, held in August, is the largest free family festival in western Canada, and if you haven't been yet, you need to put it on your bucket list and make sure you go. My favourite event is the corn-stuffing contest. It involves two people per team. One wears oversized coveralls. The other team member stuffs as much corn as possible into the coveralls of his teammate. The team with the most corn stuffed in a given time wins. There are lots of laughs and lots to eat.

Mr. Speaker, I could talk for hours about the residents of Taber, but time will not permit it. Let me just conclude by saying that if the world had more people like the people of Taber, it would be a better place indeed.

### Bow River Basin Council

**Mr. Westhead:** The Bow River Basin Council was established in 1992 as an advisory body to Alberta Environment. The council's mandate is to pursue co-operative strategies for water management and environmental stewardship of the Bow River basin. In 2004 the BRBC was designated by Alberta Environment as the first watershed planning and advisory council in Alberta's water for life strategy. It serves as a multistakeholder nonprofit organization assessing watershed conditions and developing plans to address concerns.

The BRBC envisions a future in which the Bow River is recognized among the world's best-managed watersheds, with the highest water quality of any densely populated river basin in Canada. The council completed several Bow basin state-of-the-watershed assessments and is currently working on the Bow's watershed management plan. This plan will put a special focus on riparian zones, aquatic ecosystems, water quantity and quality, and the effects of land use on surface water and groundwater.

With the Bow River closed to additional surface licence applications, stakeholder co-operation and conservation are crucial. The council includes representation from urban and rural

municipalities, agriculture, recreation, industry, nonprofits, and First Nations peoples. The collaborative work of the BRBC represents value leveraging based on an in-kind value of donated expertise. This represents up to three times a project's actual financial costs or more.

As a result of the dedicated effort of its stakeholder members, the work of the BRBC has been recognized with both an Alberta Emerald award and the city of Calgary's environmental achievement award. I'm pleased to highlight the good work that the Bow River Basin Council does year after year to provide all those who rely on the basin with a well-managed watershed.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Hays.

### Provincial Fiscal Position

**Mr. McIver:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. The NDP government is fond of comparing Alberta's financial position to that of other provinces. They constantly crow about how our net debt is better than one province's or how our taxes are lower than another's. When the opposition, supported by many responsible Alberta families, points out how much debt is being racked up by this government, how many jobs have been lost, how much investment has fled the province, the government always seems to fall back to the same old line: well, we're still better than some other provinces in some areas.

Alberta is the greatest among many great provinces in this great country. There was a time when that fact was so apparent that no one was even arguing the point. Alberta was that far out in front. Previous governments along with millions of hard-working Albertans worked tirelessly to keep Alberta that far ahead. A perfect example is Alberta's low tax rates, which the government likes to compare to other provinces'. Well, economists and business groups often point out how the NDP has eroded this advantage by hiking corporate and personal taxes, introducing a carbon tax, increasing the minimum wage, and introducing a variety of labour and other regulations, which have made Alberta a more difficult place in which to live, invest, do business, and create jobs.

Mr. Speaker, nonprofits, charities, businesses, seniors' homes, school boards, and, yes, families have made it clear that this government's policies are not making life better for them. Albertans expect and deserve better. We have been better. Since Alberta's founding in 1905 countless Albertans have worked to build this province into the best place to live, work, play, and raise a family. I just hope that in 2019 we get a government which is more interested in selling Alberta's strengths to the world instead of saying: well, we haven't quite fallen into second or third place yet. Albertans want and deserve better.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Sherwood Park.

### Edmonton and Area Land Trust

**Ms McKittrick:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. The Edmonton and Area Land Trust is a conservation nonprofit that is the only land trust in Alberta that focuses on the capital region. Their work is to conserve and steward our local natural areas. Securing these natural areas provides habitat for wildlife and strengthens the ecological resiliency of the region. It also provides recreational areas for residents and visitors alike and helps educate the public about the many benefits of conservation. The group also plays an important role in providing input into policy and educational development.

Two of their conservation lands, Golden Ranches and Hicks, are located just outside my constituency. The group is also involved in the Beaver Hills biosphere reserve, a UNESCO-designated reserve.

As the fastest growing region in Canada, having those protected natural areas in our region truly is a gift to be treasured. These land trusts are important in Alberta because they respond directly to the needs and values of local communities. They also provide a vehicle for landowners to donate their land or to register a caveat on their land to protect its important conservation values in perpetuity.

For the past 10 years this group has conserved 12 conservation areas, with the goal to acquire two more in 2018. Of the lands they are conserving and stewarding, six of these properties have been secured with the assistance of government funds from the Alberta land trust grant program. This program has been crucial to their success, demonstrating our government's commitment to being a partner in conservation. As well as the ongoing support of this government the Edmonton and Area Land Trust could not do the work they do without the support and stewardship of hundreds of volunteers, and this week is volunteer week.

I would like to take the opportunity to thank the Edmonton and Area Land Trust for their tireless and valuable work preserving natural areas in our region. I am proud to continue working with them to ensure our government's support of their important work. Congratulations to the Edmonton and Area Land Trust on celebrating their 10th anniversary in 2018.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Lac La Biche-St. Paul-Two Hills.

### Edgar Corbière

**Mr. Hanson:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. On Sunday, April 15, Alberta lost a great man, Mr. Edgar Corbière. I've spoken before about the amazing accomplishments of this man. In 1999 Edgar saw six covered wagons being drawn by horses, and it gave him an idea. That idea initially was to have some fun using horses to do things the old way, cutting hay and road building. He decided they should at the same time raise some money to assist cancer victims undergoing treatment. That first year they raised \$3,500 and helped 12 families of patients receiving treatment.

Over the last 20 years Edgar's little idea has grown exponentially. The group has introduced new attractions like log sawing, a shingle mill, a blacksmith shop, cutting and threshing grain, homemade ice cream, and on and on. In August 2017, over the long weekend, Haying in the 30's raised \$262,000.

I have to mention that this entire organization is built on volunteers and donations, and every penny raised goes to support families of cancer victims. The many buildings and attractions are donated, and these are held by volunteers to add to the experience. I was told that one of Edgar's favourite things to do was to bring beer and doughnuts to the volunteers at the work bees.

1:50

The event is held every August long weekend near the community of Mallaig, about 20 minutes north of St. Paul, and I would encourage everyone to put that on their bucket list as well. This year celebrates 20 years of Edgar's vision.

I want to read a quick testimonial of Edgar's generosity.

Words don't seem to be enough to express my thanks for the cheque I received last fall. A person doesn't realize how costly those trips to Edmonton for treatment are until you start going every 3 weeks... It was greatly appreciated and I can't say enough what a great thing you are doing.

Edgar, your legacy will live on far into the future. You've inspired many in your family, your community, and our entire province. Thank you for your enormous contribution. You will be missed.

## Oral Question Period

**The Speaker:** The hon. Leader of the Official Opposition.

### Provincial Response to Pipeline Opposition

**Mr. Kenney:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Let me begin with a belated expression of happy birthday to our Premier.

Now, Mr. Speaker, yesterday her counterpart in Victoria, Premier Horgan, told his Legislature that the Premier of Alberta has said that she does not want to proceed with that legislation, Bill 12, the turn-off-the-taps bill. Why did Premier Horgan say that?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Premier.

**Ms Notley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. You know, unlike the member opposite, I have absolutely never wavered on this issue. We will do whatever it takes to build Trans Mountain. Now, the member opposite is trying to use other people's quotes about other people's quotes about other people's quotes to attack my resolve, but his own cousins in Ottawa are calling a federal backstop for this project disgusting. So can the member explain why it was okay for Conservatives to pour billions of dollars into protecting Ontario's auto sector but with the energy industry it's disgusting?

**Mr. Kenney:** The Premier is back to auditioning for opposition leader, Mr. Speaker, and she'll get plenty of chances to ask questions in the future.

Mr. Speaker, the question I have is that the minister of the environment in British Columbia, a New Democrat, said yesterday in the Legislature that clearly Bill 12 is a bluff: they, Alberta, don't intend to use it. Why would he say that? Could it possibly be because this Premier told John Horgan last Sunday that she doesn't intend to use the bluff?

**Ms Notley:** Well, Mr. Speaker, as I've already said very clearly both publicly and as I articulated as to what I said privately, we will do whatever it takes to get this pipeline built. The country is fully aware of our resolve, and there is no question about that. But I would suggest that the member opposite ought not spend his time dining out on the opposition, aligning with the government of B.C., planning collective efforts to take the matter to court and delay it for months and months and years and years and instead stand squarely behind the efforts of our government to get this pipeline built.

**Mr. Kenney:** Well, Mr. Speaker, weakness invites strength from your adversaries. That's what's happened. This government folded on the wine boycott, they declared victory a month ago, and now today John Horgan, the Premier of B.C., is announcing that he's going to the court after all, seeking to delay further this pipeline. So I'll ask this again. Why did the Premier initially mock and ridicule the idea of turning off the taps? Why did she fold on her wine boycott? Why did she tell the Premier of B.C. that all of this is just one big bluff?

**Ms Notley:** Well, Mr. Speaker, none of that stuff happened, so that's the answer to that question. The fact of the matter is that the member opposite simply can't get his story straight. First he said that he supported investing in the pipeline. Then he said: well, only if the feds support it. Then his big brother in Ottawa said: "Well, no. The feds supporting it would be disgusting." Then he said no and that he wants to take it to court. It is hardly surprising that these guys couldn't get it done when they had the chance. I suggest that

they support us instead of taking shots at us and support the leadership we are showing to get the job done.

**The Speaker:** Second main question.

**Mr. Kenney:** Mr. Speaker, if the Premier really wants to talk about the positions of federal parties, I'm compelled to remind her that her federal party wants to shut down all the pipelines.

### Police Release of Information on Serious Incidents

**Mr. Kenney:** Mr. Speaker, on March 27 Constable Jordan Forget was shot repeatedly in Calgary in the performance of his duties. On April 10 a knife-wielding man attacked another Calgary police officer. The government has refused to release the names of the assailants. Why is the government protecting the identities of these would-be cop killers?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Justice and Solicitor General.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. You know, it's certainly the position of the government that we absolutely support our front-line officers. We've been willing to put our money where our mouth is on that multiple times. With respect to this issue ASIRT, who is an independent investigative body which is independent of government, has a policy, a policy which is consistent among such outfits across the country, so the government is not refusing to name the individuals.

**Mr. Kenney:** Mr. Speaker, that minister is responsible for law enforcement in Alberta. She can't duck or dodge on this issue. The Calgary Police Association and the Alberta Federation of Police Associations have both called on the government to give transparency with the release of these names, which was the policy of that task force in the past. Let me repeat: why won't the Attorney General instruct ASIRT to release the identities of these two people who had tried to kill Calgary police officers in the line of duty?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Obviously, this is a matter which has an enormous amount of public interest, but a matter having a large amount of public interest is precisely the time at which it is important to allow independent investigative bodies to continue to be independent. I don't generally exercise operational jurisdiction over these agencies. We allow them to make their own decisions, and we think that that's very important in the interest of public transparency.

**Mr. Kenney:** Mr. Speaker, last week in this Chamber the minister of social services said, "Our thoughts are with the family and loved ones of the deceased," the deceased being the person who tried to kill a Calgary police officer. That minister gave no expression of concern for the police officers who almost died in the line of duty, but he went out of his way to express condolences for the repeat criminals, the serious violent criminals. Why did he do that?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Justice.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I have been clear in this House on behalf of our government that our thoughts are absolutely with the officer and his family in this instance. We are absolutely aware that police officers put themselves in harm's way every day in order to protect us, that their families undergo having to worry about those individuals every day in order that the rest of



our families can be safe. Our thoughts are absolutely with those police officers.

**The Speaker:** Third main question.

### Justice System Delays

**Mr. Kenney:** Mr. Speaker, yesterday the Court of Queen's Bench in Calgary stayed charges on Nick Chan, a notorious gang leader, including the charge of first-degree murder. A year ago the NDP government told us that they were going to triage cases before the courts to ensure that serious, violent offences were brought to trial, but now we see the release of gang leaders and alleged first-degree murderers. Why did the government let this happen?

**Ms Notley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I'd like to begin, of course, by saying that I think that I join with all Albertans in expressing the fact that organized crime is a scourge on our communities, and we must do everything we can to stop it. We must support our law enforcement officers in the very complex work that is associated with investigating and prosecuting that kind of crime. In the case at hand we've just been advised that the matter has been appealed. As a result, with it being in front of the courts, we cannot speak to it specifically.

**Mr. Kenney:** I'm not asking the government to comment on the appeal, Mr. Speaker. I'm asking them to comment on their failure effectively to prioritize first-degree murder prosecutions, which are now being released by the courts.

Now, in March Provincial Court Justice Renée Cochard stayed several charges in a domestic violence case for the same reasons. The government told us that they were giving prosecutors the tools to focus on serious and violent crimes a year ago. Clearly, that hasn't happened. Why hasn't it happened? Why are we seeing serious, violent criminals released before they can be brought to justice?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Justice.

2:00

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Of course, I as well would like to express our condolences to the families and communities who are awaiting justice in this particular circumstance. I'm very concerned about these issues of court timelines. This matter, as has been stated, is under appeal, so I can't speak specifically to the case. However, our government has been clear repeatedly with the federal government that we need to see the appointment of additional superior court justices. This current government has recognized the positions we created, so it's certainly a step ahead of their predecessors. But we do need . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.

**Mr. Kenney:** Mr. Speaker, the latter point is simply false. There were, I think, one or two Queen's Bench vacancies when the Liberals came to office. There are now 12. So much for the effectiveness of the provincial NDP in ensuring that we have a proper complement of judges, but that's not the issue.

The issue is that that Attorney General a year ago committed to prioritizing the prosecution of violent and repeat offenders, but violent and repeat offenders are being released. This is not a question for a particular case. It's a question of a policy failure. Why did the government fail to keep its word to bring to justice violent offenders?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Justice and Solicitor General.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I think it's important to correct the record on this particular matter. There are currently that number of superior court vacancies. That is because this government and our predecessors created federal court positions, indicating that Alberta needed a higher number of superior court justices, that Mr. Harper's government . . .

**An Hon. Member:** Name.

**Ms Ganley:** . . . sorry, the former federal government refused to acknowledge. You know, the current government has acknowledged, and we are making progress.

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

The hon. Member for Calgary-South East.

### Legal Aid

**Mr. Fraser:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. "Like a shackled and starving foster child locked in a filthy closet for years, the Legal Aid program is a neglected and degraded shadow of its true potential and is robbing poor and disadvantaged Albertans of their futures." That's what the president of the criminal defence lawyers association, Ian Savage, had to say about the current state of legal aid. He said that the government knows how to fix the issue but would rather direct their resources elsewhere. To the Minister of Justice: how is this anything other than a complete failure of your responsibility to provide legal aid to vulnerable Albertans?

**Ms Notley:** Mr. Speaker, when our government took office from the government that that member opposite was a member of, Alberta had the lowest per capita funding for legal aid anywhere in the country, and there was a crisis, a profound level of crisis in legal aid. Since that time, in the face of the significant fiscal pressures that our government inherited from the previous government, we have increased legal aid funding by 40 per cent. That is significant because we know access to justice is fundamentally important.

**The Speaker:** First supplemental.

**Mr. Fraser:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Savage also said that the organization would stop their volunteer services until this government got their act together. Specifically, he referred to the government's most recent budget as a complete slap in the face. I asked the minister in estimates what her rationale was for not increasing the legal aid budget from their spending forecast from the previous year. To the same minister: now that you've driven defence lawyers to essentially quitting over lack of funding, perhaps you'd like to try again to justify holding your funding flat.

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. It is absolutely the case that when we inherited this situation from the former government, of which that member was a member, we thought that legal aid was underfunded. That's why we have increased the funding to legal aid over the course of our tenure by 38 per cent. That is a larger increase than anything else in my budget has received, and it's certainly much better than members opposite would have done in the same situation.

**The Speaker:** Second supplemental.

**Mr. Fraser:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. In response to Mr. Savage's concerns – and, again, the concerns are so great that it caused the defence lawyers to withdraw their volunteer services from Legal

Aid – the minister said: they've been doing quite a good job, and obviously we've been able to increase their funding such that they're able to keep up with the workload. Minister, there is clearly a complete disconnect between what you and the lawyers delivering these services are talking about. To the same minister: are you ignoring the problem, concealing the problem, or are you suggesting that these volunteers are liars?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Justice.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. If anyone had ignored this problem, it was the former government, of which that member was a member. That's why we have increased funding to legal aid by 38 per cent. That is a larger increase than any other area in my budget has seen. We certainly hope that when the time comes, the member opposite will continue to support that. We will continue to work with Legal Aid to ensure that they have adequate funding, as do all areas of the justice system.

### Canadians' Views on Oil and Gas Transportation

**Mr. Westhead:** Mr. Speaker, the Angus Reid Institute released a nation-wide opinion poll today regarding the Trans Mountain pipeline expansion. The poll demonstrated that two-thirds of Canadians say the B.C. government is wrong to try to block the pipeline. This represents a 10 percentage point increase since February. In addition, a majority of Canadians support the project, including a majority of British Columbians. To the Minister of Energy: what has the government done to be so successful in influencing the opinions of Canadians that this project is in the national interest?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Energy.

**Ms McCuaig-Boyd:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. You know, I'm proud that our Premier has the highest approval rating amongst Canadian leaders for the work she's done to continue to support this pipeline. It's proof that results are happening. Overall support of the pipeline is increasing, up 10 per cent since February. We've always said that if we show that we have a credible climate leadership plan, that we have support, that this is in the national interest, and that we have leadership in our Premier, this would happen. This is proof. I know this isn't what the opposition wants to see, that we were getting things done. But indeed people are moving towards . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.  
First supplemental.

**Mr. Westhead:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. To the same minister: given that the Angus Reid poll also indicates that tanker traffic and a need for a visible and effective emergency response that people can have confidence in to protect Canada's west coast is top of mind for Canadians, what assurances can you provide that this concern is being adequately addressed?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms McCuaig-Boyd:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. You know, this is an important issue. We've always said that B.C.'s Pacific coast is Canada's coast. It belongs to all Canadians, not just B.C. Albertans are Canadians, and we take coastline safety very seriously. That's why I'm pleased to note that with the approval of the Trans Mountain pipeline comes a \$1.5 billion investment by the federal government to look at improving the oceans protection plan. This will improve the spill responses and the marine safety, something

that is important to us all. I will note that there's a total of 157 conditions . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.  
Second supplemental.

**Mr. Westhead:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Again, to the same minister: given that the Angus Reid poll shows that a majority of Canadians, including a majority of British Columbians, agree that the B.C. government should give in and allow the pipeline to be built if Alberta cuts back on oil and gas exports and that cutting exports is one of the most likely consequences to occur, will the minister commit to using this tool if it becomes necessary?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms McCuaig-Boyd:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. You know, we know that every day we wait, Albertans and Canadians are losing millions of dollars in revenue, to the tune of \$40 million a day. That's money that can be used for roads, schools, social programs, all kinds of good things. I know the UCP wants to join in further delaying tactics like tying it up in court because it serves their political interests. Well, Albertans and Canadians are tired – tired – of political gamesmanship on this file. They want to see this matter get resolved. They want to see the pipeline built, and so do we. To be clear, this pipeline will get built.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Elbow.

### Bill 12

**Mr. Clark:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Now, this week the government introduced a bill that will allow the minister to control the flow of Alberta's natural resources to maximize the return to Albertans. It's a shame that it had to come to this, but here we are. Now, I understand that the industry is generally supportive of the bill, but I feel strongly that they should have assurances that the government will not retain the power to arbitrarily dictate to whom and how their products will be shipped and retain that power in perpetuity. To the Premier. This bill gives your government a huge amount of power. What controls will you put in place to ensure that if it is used, it will be used responsibly?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms McCuaig-Boyd:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. You know, we took our time to get this bill right. There was consultation, legal advice, and we feel that this bill is going to be a great tool for us to use. The bill itself is an enabling bill, and it allows us to be very flexible, looking at different hydrocarbons as we move forward. Regulations will follow that will support that bill.

**The Speaker:** First supplemental.

**Mr. Clark:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. Now, given the extraordinary circumstances under which this bill is being introduced and given that the situation it seeks to rectify will hopefully be short lived, again to the Premier. When this bill comes up for debate, we intend to bring an amendment that will add a sunset clause in the form of a legislative review in two years' time. That will be when we have a better understanding of whether the government still requires these broad powers. When we do introduce that amendment, Madam Minister, will you support it?

2:10

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Energy.

**Ms McCuaig-Boyd:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. I certainly look forward to debating the bill in this House. As was referenced, it's sad that we've gotten to this state. This isn't legislation that we're going to use lightly, but to be clear, we will use it if need be. We are more than determined; we are relentless that this pipeline is going to get built.

**The Speaker:** Second supplemental.

**Mr. Clark:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Now, given the potentially significant impact on oil and gas producers and shippers if you do have to use these powers and given that these are Alberta companies that have been operating within the bounds of the law and have done nothing to warrant being used as pawns in this political game, once more to the Premier: will you commit to compensating any company who is disadvantaged by any action that you need to take under Bill 12?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms McCuaig-Boyd:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. You know, I met last Friday with many stakeholders representing hundreds of companies in our industry. Again, we all agreed that it's too bad that we've gotten to this point, but we are united in the fact that something needs to be done. We certainly have broad support for what we're doing. I can quote Mark Scholz of the Canadian Association of Oilwell Drilling Contractors: I think it's very prudent and shows bold leadership on the part of the Premier, and it's certainly something we're supporting. PSAC: PSAC recognizes the Premier and the government of Alberta for standing up for Alberta's energy industry to ensure that the Trans Mountain . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.  
The hon. Member for Airdrie.

#### **Justice System Delays** (continued)

**Mrs. Pitt:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Alleged Calgary gang leader Nick Chan was released from custody this week. He had been charged with first-degree murder, conspiracy, and directing a criminal organization. He was released because the trial had not taken place within a reasonable time. The triage protocol is not working. Minister, what are you doing so that violent criminals stop being released back into our communities, where our children are?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Justice and Solicitor General.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Again, of course, this case is of concern to the government, absolutely. We will continue to work on this issue. This case was in superior court. We do suffer from the lowest number of superior court justices per capita. That is a continual concern. I have written to my federal counterpart numerous times on this. I've written again to her just recently, and I'm happy to table that letter. In addition, we have a number of other strategies, which I'm sure I will get the opportunity to outline.

**Mrs. Pitt:** Mr. Speaker, this is extremely serious. Mr. Chan would allegedly pay \$10,000 for successful hits on rival gangsters, and he is suspected of a triple murder in 2009. Given that this is not a case of being found not guilty – this is a case of running out of time; the courts are backlogged, and this minister has taken way too long to fix this – what is this minister going to do to fix this problem so that people can feel safe in our communities again?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Justice.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Absolutely, this problem is of concern. That's why we've been advocating for more superior court justices. That's why we've been investing throughout the justice system. Certainly, we've taken steps with respect to this. We've taken steps to find efficiencies. We've also taken steps to add resources. I find it a little surprising that after singling out my budget to vote against the increases last year and again singling out to vote against the supplementary supply to support those things, the hon. member is able to stand up and accuse the government of not taking action.

**Mrs. Pitt:** Mr. Speaker, just a little over a year ago the Justice minister said, "Things will not be lost as prosecutions merely because of timing, but prosecutors are empowered to make the decisions necessary to focus on serious and violent crimes." Clearly, that has failed. What is this minister going to do to instill confidence in our justice system for the people in this province?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Of course, we're extremely concerned about that. That's why, as I've said, we've been advocating with the federal government to get more superior court justices, we've been taking steps to ensure that our justice system is working efficiently, and we've also been making investments in our justice system to ensure that we're keeping on top of the resourcing. Resources are absolutely a component of this problem. This government has been investing while the opposition has been standing up to knock down those increases and to say that they're not worth it.

**Mr. Kenney:** Mr. Speaker, what the Justice minister has said just now is manifestly untrue. The problem is that a year ago she committed to triaging serious, violent offenders in the criminal justice system through the prosecutorial service. She has failed to keep her word. We now have gang leaders suspected of triple homicide being released. Can the minister indicate: are there higher priority cases out there to which resources have been directed? Why a total failure in keeping her commitment to prioritize the prosecution of serious repeat offenders?

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. member.  
The hon. Minister of Justice.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. The prosecution service absolutely continues to work hard to prioritize those cases. There are a number of components to the justice system. The prosecution service is certainly one of them. Ensuring that we have a sufficient number of superior court justices is another one of them. In fact, Alberta became the jurisdiction with the lowest number of superior court justices, which had an impact in this particular case, under that member's government.

**Mr. Kenney:** Given that this minister seems more focused on covering for her ally Justin Trudeau than getting justice done, Mr. Speaker, and given that the Trudeau government has been in office for two and a half years and given that this minister a year ago said that she would prioritize the prosecution of serious repeat offenders, why has she so manifestly failed to keep her word?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Certainly, this is a problem that has occurred under the current federal government. We have absolutely been advocating for these justices. We are absolutely getting frustrated that they haven't been appointed. But

I think that in this instance there is a sufficient deficit in justices to go around. Certainly, the current federal government didn't do anything about it, but neither did the former federal government when that member was sitting around the cabinet table.

**Mr. Kenney:** Mr. Speaker, given that the minister keeps trying to pass the buck and given that a year ago she said that she would prioritize the prosecution of serious repeat offenders, why was that commitment not respected with this particular case, a triple murderer and a gangland leader? Why is this kind of person getting off scot-free to go back into our communities when this minister said that people like that would face justice?

**Ms Ganley:** Mr. Speaker, we are absolutely concerned about this case. As I've said, it is presently under appeal, so I can't speak to the specifics. I will continue to say that we have advocated for more justices. We have brought forward a budget and multiple budgets that have invested in the justice system. We have brought forward changes to ensure that we're able to bring forward these serious and violent matters. The members opposite have spoken out against all of those things.

**Mr. Bilous:** They voted against them.

**Ms Ganley:** And they voted against all of those things. This government has a record of investing in the system, of making the necessary changes, and those folks have a record of criticizing.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.  
The hon. Member for Lacombe-Ponoka.

### Carbon Levy Economic Impact

**Mr. Orr:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. This government is still trying to send a message to Albertans that the economy is in recovery and things are looking up, up, up, but for the average everyday Albertan and businesses this is just not their reality. Food banks in my riding say that this is not the case. One in Airdrie has said that the use has skyrocketed and that the demand has doubled and doubled again since 2012. When will you open your eyes and see that the carbon tax is hurting working families and nonprofits in this province? Why aren't you listening?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Economic Development and Trade.

**Mr. Bilous:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. You know what? We know that not every small business and not-for-profit in the province has felt the recovery. We do know that Alberta led the country last year in growth, that we're on track to lead the country this year in economic growth, and that's because of our incredible, resilient, hard-working businesses that have weathered the downturn. Our government has provided a number of supports to support diversification and small businesses. We're continuing to invest in Albertans and in our communities, and we will continue to do so. I hope the members opposite will support our budget.

2:20

**Mr. Orr:** That's why people are lining up at food banks.

Given that there are huge unemployment issues as well and even working families all over the province are now not making enough to cover their bills due to the increased cost of heating their homes, increased cost to buy groceries, which are all necessities of life, and given, Minister, that children are going to bed hungry in this province, that is slowly being decimated by the costs of the carbon

tax, how can this government justify taking from the poorest in our society to line their own pockets?

**Mr. Mason:** Point of order.

**The Speaker:** Point of order noted.  
The hon. minister.

**Mr. Bilous:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Our government has committed to investing in this province, investing in the people in this province. There are a number of programs that we've rolled out to support families. When it comes to the carbon levy, two-thirds of Alberta families are receiving the rebate. We're investing in efficiencies, in businesses, in not-for-profits, in seniors' homes. Our government is investing in Alberta and Albertans. It's shameful that the members opposite one day will call for spending, the next day call for cutting. Our government has a path to balance. We're diversifying the economy, we're protecting public services, and we're proud of it.

**Mr. Orr:** Given that this government has already given the go-ahead to hike the carbon tax 67 per cent in the budget, is the government going to at least perform an economic impact study to see how these increases will affect families and food banks, to see if they will be able to afford to keep the lights on and continue feeding the province, or do they even care?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Environment and Parks.

**Ms Phillips:** Well, thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Of course, we released economic modelling on the topic of the federal proposal under the pan-Canadian framework in October of 2016 and in the context of pipeline approvals, which we then achieved, unlike the members opposite. The economy will grow in part because we have rebates going to two-thirds of Albertans. But here are other reasons why the economy will grow: because we have a child benefit that is going to 300,000 Albertans, because we have expanded school nutrition programs to 30,000 children, because we've increased the minimum wage. Sixty per cent of folks who earn it are women. That's what we're ...

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.  
The hon. Member for Lethbridge-East.

### Southern Alberta Flooding

**Ms Fitzpatrick:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Our thoughts are with the families and businesses who are being affected by the flooding in southern Alberta and those people who are concerned about their property and that of municipalities and First Nations. To the Minister of Municipal Affairs: what efforts are being taken to support municipalities and First Nations in their efforts to keep their communities safe?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Municipal Affairs.

**Mr. S. Anderson:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker, and thank you to the hon. member for the question. First off, I would like to say that I am thinking about the people from southern Albertan and actually have been in contact with multiple mayors down there about that. I'd also like to recognize the emergency management people down there, local officials on the ground, and the hundreds and hundreds of volunteers that are trying to protect lives and keep properties safe. We have field officers on the ground down there as we speak, and we are in contact hourly and providing assistance when needed and where needed at the request of the local municipalities.

**The Speaker:** First supplemental.

**Ms Fitzpatrick:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. To the Minister of Indigenous Relations: given that Siksika First Nation are under a state of local emergency and given that they are currently dealing with washed out roads, what assurances can you provide that the government is supporting in this emergency response?

**The Speaker:** The Minister of Indigenous Relations.

**Mr. Feehan:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I'm happy to say that I spoke with Chief Joe Weasel Child yesterday at Siksika Nation to discuss the circumstances on Siksika and, of course, to ensure that we are offering supports to the nation from our province. He was quite aware that our Emergency Management Agency team is already engaged, that supports have been offered from Transportation and from Environment and Parks as well. We're doing the right thing right now on a number of fronts. We're ensuring the safety of the people in the Siksika Nation.

**The Speaker:** Second supplemental.

**Ms Fitzpatrick:** Again thank you, Mr. Speaker. To the Minister of Municipal Affairs: given that the weather will be getting warmer over the coming days and given that there are concerns that the warmer weather will mean that these communities could be dealing with more water, what are you doing to prepare?

**Mr. S. Anderson:** Thank you to the member for the question. The Alberta Emergency Management Agency and Environment and Parks are working collaboratively to assist the communities with advice, with know-how, people, and equipment. Also, our Provincial Operations Centre is open 24 hours a day, seven days a week. Mr. Speaker, we're continuously monitoring the situation. We know we have to work with the local authorities down there, who are doing a fantastic job, by the way, and we will continue to work with them so we can adapt as the situation goes along.

### Electricity System

**Mr. Panda:** Mr. Speaker, with electricity prices getting more expensive as a result of the NDP's ideological actions like the accelerated coal phase-out, the PPA debacle, and the introduction of a capacity market, to the Minister of Energy: how many billions of dollars of public money has been burned by the NDP's electricity policy to date, and how much per year will it cost going forward? Minister, Albertans are watching. They want to know the real numbers, not rhetoric, and if you don't have the numbers, will you please commit to . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. member.  
The Minister of Energy.

**Ms McCuaig-Boyd:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. You know, we have spent a lot of time in fixing a system that was broken for a number of years, relying on its volatility in order to even make money. We saw a situation where there was a lack of investment, so along with our climate leadership plan and going to 30 per cent renewables by 2030, we are fixing our system and doing a number of things. We're very confident. We're on schedule. Things are looking up, and we know that families can count on . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.

**Mr. Panda:** Mr. Speaker, given that I asked for the actual numbers and didn't get them, let me try again. Had the NDP not triggered

the power purchase agreement's cancellation clause and accelerated the coal phase-out, the minister would not have to create the capacity market. Will the Minister of Energy admit that without the capacity market our Whac-A-Mole electricity policy has made the grid unstable and unreliable?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms McCuaig-Boyd:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. You know, all along in this transition in our electricity system we have consulted everybody, a lot of stakeholders in electricity. We know that the current system we had when we came into government was one of two in all of North America, and it relied on volatility. We're moving to a more stable system, one where there are more predictable prices, 30 per cent renewables by 2030, and the capacity market is part of that. That's a system that's used in many systems throughout North America. It's a well-known, well-respected system, and investors like that part.

**Mr. Panda:** Mr. Speaker, given that Keephills 3 and Genesee 3 are super critical coal-fired power plants with the lowest emissions of all coal plants and given that these coal-fired power plants could be made zero-emissions with carbon capture and storage technology, would the minister still order the shutdown of these coal-fired plants, putting families out of work, and creating uncertainty purely out of ideology, even if their emissions were zero?

**Ms Phillips:** Well, you know, Mr. Speaker, in 2012 a certain government with a certain member around the cabinet table passed some regulations that phased out 12 of our 18 plants, and those phase-outs would have started in 2019. You know what the plan was to replace that generation? Zero. Goose egg. There was no plan to replace the generation. There was no plan for the workers or those communities. Now there is. We're phasing in renewables. We are making sure that we've got a coal transition worker fund of some \$40 million. We are finding ways to invest in communities through community generation and other projects, and now these guys want us to spend billions of dollars on an unproven technology? The answer is no.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.

### Health Care Accessibility

**Mr. Yao:** Mr. Speaker, I think we can all agree that Fort McMurray has given a lot to the province over the years. However, in return we've gotten smears, ostracism, and now medical insecurity. From orthopaedics to pediatrics to obstetrics the constituents of the municipality of Wood Buffalo had to travel to Edmonton to access these vital services over 22,000 times in 2017. Our only dialysis clinic runs three days a week, making constituents travel to Edmonton for treatment. Does the Minister of Health think that rural Albertans deserve reasonable access to proper health care?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Health and Deputy Premier.  
2:30

**Ms Hoffman:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I'm incredibly proud of the work we've done to protect the public health care system and to expand services throughout our province. We knew what was coming in 2015, and Albertans voted no for that. There were a billion dollars' worth of cuts to the public health care system. There was a health care premium that would have been a tax on families throughout our province. That was resoundingly rejected. We know that on this side of the House, we've brought forward

stability and we've brought forward reasonable agreements with our labour partners, that give that to the people of Alberta.

I look forward to finding out what the members opposite are going to do with our Health budget. I have a feeling that I know, but we'll see tomorrow.

**Mr. Yao:** Let's change gears here, Mr. Speaker. The Auditor General talks about the duplication of the bureaucracy. Administration is so deep that it actually impairs the system. In the estimates last year I asked you about the 10,000 employees that were hired by AHS over the last several years. You could only account for 1,500 of them being front line. [interjections] Through . . .

**The Speaker:** Keep going.

**Mr. Nixon:** Point of order.

**Mr. Yao:** Mr. Speaker, you can throw a tennis ball down the halls of AHS administration here on any given Friday and not see anybody. There are salaried doctors seeing four patients a day. Has this minister done anything to lean up the bureaucracy so that patients in Calgary do not have to wait 10 months for a hip surgery and that kids in Edmonton do not have to wait . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

The hon. minister.

**Ms Hoffman:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I'm so proud of the work that we've done on this side of the House to protect the front-line services that those members fight to cut every single day. You know what a billion dollars' worth of cuts would mean? It would mean longer wait times. It would mean fewer resources and less support. Instead, we have a government that's standing with the people of Alberta, that's expanding home-care services by 19 per cent in this budget alone because we want to support people in staying in their homes and doing so safely with the right support. We're building Willow Square, a long-needed facility in the member's own riding, because we know on this side of the House that Albertans deserve to live in the communities that they choose and to have the right health care supports. On that side of the House your colleagues keep advocating for us to privatize it. I know who's standing up for the people of . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.

It seems to me, folks, that the tone is getting a little too escalated in here. You've got to calm down. Calm down.

**Mr. Yao:** Mr. Speaker, if they looked at the CIHI reports, they'd see that they're failing in every regard.

Mr. Speaker, an elderly constituent approached me last week about how he wants to spend his golden years in Fort McMurray and that given that he now needs dialysis and can't access the three-day-a-week clinic in Fort McMurray, he must spend his days in Edmonton. Minister, despite your best efforts with carbon taxes to discourage people from driving fossil-fuelled vehicles, they are forced to drive to Edmonton for a treatment. Would you allow this clinic to be open for a few extra days in the week and allow them to stay within their community?

**Ms Hoffman:** Mr. Speaker, we have a proven track record of standing up for the public health care system in this province and encouraging opportunities for us to make care closer to home. I'd certainly be happy to look into this specific instance just like we did in opening our dialysis clinic in Lac La Biche, something that the members opposite, when they were in government for many, many years, failed to do. They had people sitting on a bus out front. On

this side of the House we're investing in important public health care services, including those in Fort McMurray. I'm so proud of the work that we're doing there as well in maternal health and mental health, and the list goes on. Instead of deep cuts, you should be standing with us because we are working to protect services and expand them in Fort McMurray while your colleagues are calling for deep cuts and privatization.

#### Small-business Economic Indicators

**Mr. Gotfried:** Mr. Speaker, since the NDP took office, I frequently hear from struggling business owners about the oppressive cost burden, in many cases borne by them personally. From introducing and then increasing the carbon tax to rapidly increasing labour costs, small businesses have taken it on the chin. The government continually points to their small-business tax reduction as the offsetting solution. To the Minister of Finance: can you provide Albertans with any economic analysis indicating that the 1 per cent reduction in small-business tax compensates for the financial burden your government has heaped upon the small-business sector since . . .

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Economic Development and Trade.

**Mr. Bilous:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I appreciate that the member speaks with small businesses, as do I and the Minister of Finance on a daily basis. We've been travelling the province, talking about our budget and how it is supporting businesses, investing in things like infrastructure that businesses need, improving quality of life, which, again, businesses are looking for, supports within their communities. Our budget also is continuing to diversify the economy and support the job creators through a number of initiatives, which I hope, from the member's question, he will be supporting as bills 1 and 2.

**Mr. Gotfried:** Mr. Speaker, supporting job creators is not what we're hearing.

Given the Canadian Federation of Independent Business found that 92 per cent of business owners lack confidence in this government's commitment to improving the business climate and given that according to the government's own labour force data Calgary's unemployment rate actually increased in March, again to the minister: how can you look Albertans in the eye and tell them things are up, up, up when it is clear to many out-of-work Albertans that the only thing up is the unemployment in our largest city?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Mr. Bilous:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. That couldn't be further from the truth. There are a number of indicators, including jobs. There were 90,000 jobs created over the past year, the majority of those in the private sector. Our GDP is up. Manufacturing is up. Exports are up. Small-business confidence is up. The Business Development Bank of Canada says that small-business confidence is up in Alberta, with 35 per cent of small businesses looking to hire more staff and 73 per cent of them saying that they're investing in their business this year, in 2018. The other thing is that small businesses in Alberta have a greater economic impact than anywhere in the country. We're proud of our small businesses, and we'll continue to support them.

**Mr. Gotfried:** Mr. Speaker, the minister's own statistics don't bear this out.

Given that the CFIB's most recent business barometer indicates that Alberta's small-business optimism remains stagnant and is the

second lowest in the country and given the same report indicates that 18 per cent of small-business owners in Alberta are looking to cut back that staffing that he keeps referring to, again to the minister: entrepreneurs continue to lack confidence in your government, and almost 20 per cent plan to cut staff, so why do you continue to spin a completely different story to Albertans than is borne out by the statistics?

**Mr. Bilous:** Mr. Speaker, thank you to the member for the question. Again, the stats that I'm quoting are coming from third-party independents. Whether it's the Business Development Bank of Canada, TD Bank, Royal Bank, ATB, they're the ones that are giving us the indicators. We know that our exports are up. We know that restaurant receipts are up. Housing starts are up over 10 per cent. Business incorporations are up. Retail sales are up. I can tell you that Calgary is the fastest growing city on the prairies this year and will be the fastest growing city in the country next year. Compared to a year ago in Calgary, over 3,100 full-time jobs . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.  
Lac La Biche-St. Paul-Two Hills.

### Water Act Enforcement

**Mr. Hanson:** Thanks very much, Mr. Speaker. On December 11 last year I asked the environment minister about a Water Act enforcement order that was issued in August on land adjacent to the town of St. Paul. At the time of my question the landowner was already noncompliant for three months, and it's now been seven months. Minister, you said in December that all those aspects of the Water Act have top priority. Spring is here. The flooding has started. Why has nothing been done to enforce this order?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Environment and Parks.

**Ms Phillips:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I will take the matter under advisement and undertake to provide the hon. member the specific information that he is inquiring about on the specific case after question period.  
Thank you.

**The Speaker:** First supplemental.

**Mr. Hanson:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Given that this minister has restricted or closed access to trails in Alberta's backcountry to prevent damage to natural water courses, Minister, why will you not enforce this order where a landowner has literally filled in over a kilometre of natural water course, resulting in runoff backing up into residences in town?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Phillips:** Well, thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Of course, I have committed to looking into the matter for the hon. member. If it is part of a regulatory proceeding, we will provide him with that information as well.

**Mr. Hanson:** Mr. Speaker, the minister has known about this for seven months, and I brought it to her attention in December.

Given that the town of St. Paul is facing an estimated \$130,000 in costs to try to prevent flooding into people's homes due to lack of action by your department – your department tried to stuff this issue back onto the town of St. Paul, Minister – why should the town and taxpayers have to pay for your negligence on this file?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Phillips:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I will undertake to provide the hon. member and the House the information he has requested.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Bow.

### Flood Mitigation on the Bow River

**Drever:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I've had several constituents from the community of Bowness approach me about their concerns related to flood mitigation and upstream mitigation on the Bow River. To the Minister of Environment and Parks: what is your ministry doing for upstream flood mitigation measures?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Phillips:** Well, thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. To date the province has committed \$91.8 million for 46 projects on flood mitigation on the Bow River through the community resilience program, the flood recovery erosion control program, and the watershed restoration program. It is crucially important that we continue to invest in Calgary as a response to the devastating events that we're coming up on the fifth anniversary of. That is why we have continued to make those robust investments in and with the city of Calgary to keep communities safe.

2:40

**The Speaker:** First supplemental.

**Drever:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. What role does your ministry play in deciding how these funds will be allocated?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Phillips:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. We've committed to \$150 million over 10 years to bolster the city of Calgary's flood protection infrastructure, and we work with the city to determine the suitability of each project. The planning is done as part of a multiyear process to ensure that Calgary is flood protected. Planning is done in partnership with the city, but the city is ultimately the project manager and is responsible for the design and construction in consultation with their citizens.

**The Speaker:** Second supplemental.

**Drever:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I know that your ministry has been collaborating with the Bow River Working Group. Can you give an update to the House on the recommendations that they brought forward and how your ministry will be implementing them?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Phillips:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. We released in August the Bow River water management project, that was produced by the Bow River Working Group, and there are a number of initiatives that have come out of that report: discussions with TransAlta, discussions with the irrigation districts, feasibility studies on increasing the drawdown rate at the Ghost reservoir, initiating feasibility studies for some of the long-term projects that we know we may have to invest in over the long term. In the coming days we'll have more to say on next steps, but one thing is clear: we are working and investing to keep the people of Calgary safe.

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, in 20 seconds we'll proceed with Members' Statements.

## Members' Statements

(continued)

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark.

### GoldenBucks Bakeshop in Edmonton-Meadowlark

**Mr. Carson:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. This month I had the opportunity to meet with Edna and Evan Estigoy, owners of GoldenBucks Bakeshop, located in the La Perle community in Edmonton-Meadowlark. GoldenBucks Bakeshop specializes in Filipino baked goods. Their empanadas, yam cakes, and candies can be found at Save-On-Foods and Filipino markets across the city. They also sell some of their products from their recently opened storefront in La Perle, but their main focus is on distribution, with aspirations to sell their baked goods in stores all across Canada. They explained to me that they are already in talks with retailers in Manitoba and Saskatchewan. Based on the quality of their products and ambitions to grow, I know it's just a matter of time before they expand to new markets.

GoldenBucks is a true Albertan success story. In 2016 owner Evan Estigoy was laid off from his career as a control systems engineer. Like many other Albertans, the Estigoys were faced with the challenge of supporting their family during the economic downturn. Edna and Evan turned to their Filipino heritage and their passion for baking and cooking for inspiration. In September of 2016 they became entrepreneurs and began producing and distributing their baked goods from a rental commercial kitchen with the little money that they had saved. By November of 2017 they had successfully grown their business and were able to open their own independent facility.

I'm proud of our government for supporting small businesses by dropping the tax rate by 33 per cent and introducing targeted tax credits to support investments.

It was a pleasure to sit down with the Estigoys this month to discuss some of the rewards and challenges of starting a small business here in Alberta. This is still the beginning for GoldenBucks, and I wish them all the success with their business here in Edmonton-Meadowlark. If you haven't already done so, I encourage you to stop by their storefront or pick up some empanadas the next time you're out grocery shopping.

Thank you.

## Notices of Motions

**The Speaker:** The Official Opposition House Leader.

**Mr. Nixon:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise today to give notice pursuant to Standing Order 42 that at the appropriate time I will move the following motion:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the government not to proceed with any further increases to the carbon tax until Kinder Morgan's Trans Mountain expansion project has completed construction and commenced commercial operations.

I have the appropriate copies.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Transportation.

**Mr. Mason:** Yes, Mr. Speaker. I would like to give oral notice of a motion for tomorrow's Order Paper, the motion being:

Be it resolved that pursuant to Standing Order 4(1) commencing May 1, 2018, the Assembly shall meet on Monday, Tuesday, and Wednesday evenings for consideration of government business for the duration of the Fourth Session of the 29th Legislature 2018 spring sitting unless the Government House Leader notifies the Assembly that there shall be no evening sitting that day by

providing notice under Notices of Motion in the daily Routine or at any time prior to 6 p.m.

## Introduction of Bills

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Service Alberta and Minister of Status of Women.

### Bill 14

#### An Act to Empower Utility Consumers

**Ms McLean:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise today to introduce Bill 14, An Act to Empower Utility Consumers.

Mr. Speaker, since 2003 the UCA has a proven track record of helping to educate and mediate on behalf of Alberta's natural gas and electricity consumers. To build on this work and the work of the Member for Wetaskiwin-Camrose from last session, I am introducing this bill to make several enhancements to the services provided by the UCA. These enhancements further our government's commitment to protecting utility consumers.

[Motion carried; Bill 14 read a first time]

## Tabling Returns and Reports

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Lac La Biche-St. Paul-Two Hills.

**Mr. Hanson:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I have two tablings today. The first tabling is a copy of the enforcement order that I referred to in my question to the minister.

The second one is a letter from Nick Clark, cofounder of Utility Network and Partners Inc. He starts out by complaining about the number of e-mails he's had from ministers of the Crown requesting donations to the NDP Party. His answer is no, and he goes on to further supplement that.

**Mr. Panda:** Mr. Speaker, I rise to table page 2 of the executive summary of Alberta's Wholesale Electricity Market Transition Recommendation from the Alberta Electric System Operator, which proves that because of the coal phase-out and the increased reliance on intermittent renewables, the electricity system's reliability has been compromised, thus the need for a new market structure, ergo the capacity market.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Banff-Cochrane.

**Mr. Westhead:** Yes. Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise to table the document to which I referred in my question to the Minister of Energy. That's the Angus Reid opinion poll that was released today showing that our Premier is leading the country as the most trusted leader on the pipeline issue and that the majority of Canadians support the project.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Justice and Solicitor General.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I rise to table the most recent in a series of letters to the federal Justice minister as regards the appointment of superior court justices. I have the appropriate number of copies.

**The Speaker:** Calgary-Fish Creek.

**Mr. Gotfried:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise today to table the appropriate number of copies of a report from the Canadian Federation of Independent Business, Economics, in which their



business barometer shows the business barometer index as flat and the general state of business health trending downwards in 2018.

The second is a report of the Alberta government, Alberta Labour Force Statistics March, 2018, showing lower statistics in terms of labour force participation in March 2018 versus the prior month and the year prior and an increase in the unemployment rate from the previous month.

2:50

### Tablings to the Clerk

**The Acting Clerk:** I wish to advise the Assembly that the following document was deposited with the office of the Clerk: on behalf of the hon. Ms Ganley, Minister of Justice and Solicitor General, the Alberta Law Enforcement Review Board 2016 annual report.

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, I believe we had three points of order today, the first being by the Government House Leader.

### Point of Order

#### Allegations against Members

**Mr. Mason:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Today, I don't have the exact time, but it was sometime close to 2:30, sometime after 2:30, the Member for Lacombe-Ponoka in his questions used the expression or something to the effect that the government is lining its own pockets. Now, that is an expression, according to the Cambridge dictionary, "to earn money using dishonest or illegal methods." Another definition: "to make money esp. by using dishonest, immoral, or illegal methods."

Perhaps he doesn't fully understand the meaning of it. He may, indeed, have just intended to say that the government is receiving revenues as a result of the carbon levy, and that would certainly be true. But in his choice of language, Mr. Speaker, he has suggested something dishonest and personal aggrandizement of members of the government, which is completely unacceptable. Under 23(h), (i) and (j) I would respectfully request that you rule that the hon. member is violating those sections of our standing orders and ask him to stand in this place and apologize.

**The Speaker:** The Opposition House Leader.

**Mr. Nixon:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. As you often say in this place, context is everything. While the Government House Leader may present one interpretation of what that saying could mean, there are other interpretations of what that could mean.

Again, Mr. Speaker, the Government House Leader should let the other side speak. Now, I know he is struggling with that today, but I would ask that he would let me talk while I have the floor. The hon. member said, and I have his notes, "How can the government justify taking the poorest in society to line its own pockets?" or, as he has told me – I don't have the benefit of the Blues; you do – "their pockets?" It was either "their own pockets" or "their pockets," from the best of his recollection.

The fact is this. This is a matter of debate, Mr. Speaker. As has been raised in this House many times, the government's carbon tax is taking money away from some of the poorest people in our province. The member was pointing that out. That money, in turn, is then going to the government. That is the member's point. The carbon tax is taking away from the poor, and then it's going to the government.

As for the context, what the Government House Leader is doing is clearly a matter of debate.

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, context. I recall at least one and I think two in the last earlier sessions. There was a fairly serious

matter or point of order with respect to whether or not a comment made was aimed at an individual or at a group. In this particular instance I would say that there is no point of order. However, to the hon. member, as the Government House Leader has suggested, it may not have been your intention to reflect that, but I would urge you to be cautious, and that goes to all of the members. When we're using phrases such as that, how it's received by many people may not be intending the intention you made. In this particular instance I don't see a point of order, but nonetheless I would caution everyone.

I believe we have at least two other points of order from the Opposition House Leader.

### Point of Order

#### Remarks Off the Record

**Mr. Nixon:** Points of order. Yes. Thank you, Mr. Speaker. My first point of order that I raise, I rise on 23(h),(i) and (j), particularly language that will create disorder in this place. At the time that I raised the point of order, the hon. Member for Fort McMurray-Wood Buffalo, I believe – I always get those two Fort McMurray ridings confused – was asking a question. The Minister of Environment and Parks at that point started to yell very aggressively and quite loudly at the hon. member, telling him to speak through the chair, that type of stuff, and continued to yell him down; something that happened throughout the day today by government members.

Mr. Speaker, at the time you, I believe rightly, stood up and called the House to order and tried to stop that behaviour. Now, it may have confused the government because you did not look at the government to tell them that they were making that noise; you looked at us. But at that point you did ask them to stop. Of course, there was no heckling at all from this side of the House, has not been all day. But we have a minister who continues to yell at our members, not allowing them to ask a question. They have a right to ask their questions in this Chamber. That's what they've been brought here to do. While I understand the government can't control their childish behaviour – we've well established that – we would ask that they would at least allow our members to be able to ask their questions and speak on behalf of their constituents in here, and we would ask you, Mr. Speaker, to protect their right to do so, as is the chair's responsibility.

**Mr. Mason:** Well, Mr. Speaker, I hardly know where to begin with this. The protestations of the opposition since their new leader has taken his seat are absolutely too much to be believed. The level of decorum in this House is just fine. It is not excessive. But those people over there, before this new strategy was employed – and that's what it is; this is a strategy of the opposition – were one of the loudest, most obnoxious oppositions that I've ever seen in this place for nearly three years. There were repeated interventions as female members of the government were heckled and almost shouted down. All of a sudden a new strategy by the new leader . . .

**The Speaker:** Hon. member, get to the point of order.

**Mr. Mason:** Under (h), (i), and (j), Mr. Speaker, it's pretty clear. It's pretty clear to me that the new strategy is to reform the little rascals and turn them into the little angels, who are pointing across the aisle . . .

**The Speaker:** Get to the point of order that we're at.

Calgary-Foothills.

**Mr. Mason:** . . . and putting words in the mouths of our members and pretending to have their feelings hurt, Mr. Speaker. It's a political strategy, not a point of order. That's my point.

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

I noticed Calgary-Foothills, and now I see Airdrie. Is there additional information?

**Mrs. Pitt:** Yes, Mr. Speaker. I would like to speak to this point of order and correct the hon. Government House Leader in further adding that there are particular members on the Official Opposition side of this House, more particularly the only two female members, that happen to continuously, actually, hear louder comments from the government side. Our members on this side of the House are feeling like they're not being protected, and they're not able to speak up for their constituents.

Thank you very much.

**The Speaker:** Hon. minister, is there something substantive you'd like to say?

**Ms Ganley:** Absolutely, Mr. Speaker. I think I'd just like to add with respect to that particular point that the other day we had a series of these points of orders, where the members opposite were putting words in the mouths of our ministers, standing up and claiming to be victims, and then shouting me down as I attempted to speak. So I think that certainly this is going on all around the House, but I think the point here is that in this particular instance there is no point of order because the member was merely asking that comments be addressed through the chair.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.

It seems that whenever I allow for additional members to speak to items, the distance from the point of order seems to increase. I do have the benefit of the Blues, which you may or may not have. It reads: "You could only account for 1,500 of them being front line [interjections]." That's what it is.

Hon. members, I tried to caution and advise, bring the House to where there was an exchange of comments across from one side to the other, but I did not hear specifically who was saying what. So, as has been in the past, I don't know how I'm expected to rule on a matter when I do not hear it. Again, folks, you folks can decide as to whether or not you want to continue, you know, exchanging in these kinds of discussions in time.

In this particular instance I'm not able to hear it, nor the comment, and there is no point of order.

There is, however, a – the Opposition House Leader.

### Point of Clarification

**Mr. Nixon:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on 13(2) and ask you to explain your ruling. Clearly, we were not yelling or heckling our own members while they were asking a question. The Blues do show that there was shouting down of the hon. member asking questions, unless it's the assertion of this House that we were heckling our own member so that he could not ask the question. You did call the House to order, and the question we have that we'd like you to explain is why you won't look at that side of the House when they continue to . . .

3:00

**The Speaker:** Hon. member, please. Please, hon. member. I advised you what I heard, and I could not identify a party. I think, hon. member, you need to accept that reasoning because I did not hear it. As to where I look, I look on both sides of this House.

Government House Leader, I'm not sure that you have anything else to add to this.

**Mr. Mason:** No. You dealt with it, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** I can recall in this House when there was a considerable amount of exchange going on. I spoke to it over and over again with respect to volume, and that in no way needs to legitimize any comments that may have happened at this point in time. I submit that, firstly, the responsibility rests with all of the members. If tactics at one time or another change, I notice it on all sides with respect to that.

I have explained the reasoning, and I would therefore ask, hon. member, that you speak to your notice of motion.

**Mr. Nixon:** I've still got another point of order, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** You've got another point of order?

**Mr. Nixon:** There were three called.

**The Speaker:** Go ahead.

### Point of Order Gestures

**Mr. Nixon:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise on 23(h), (i), and (j), particularly abusive language or motions that would create disorder in the House. At the time that we called the point of order to defend our members, when, as you pointed out, the Blues show that there was a disruption in the House that you were trying to get control of, the Government House Leader, keeping in line with the immature actions of this NDP caucus in this House, then started to make motions with his eyes towards this side of the House, with his hands, that would indicate, you know, traditionally inside this House that we were crybabies or we were crying about the abuse that we were being subjected to by the minister of environment.

I would ask that he withdraw and apologize for those actions. He's better than that, and he needs to get control of the immature actions of his caucus and himself in this Assembly.

**Mr. Mason:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Well, nothing could be further from the truth. I did have something in my eye, and I did rub my eye. Obviously, the hon. member took that completely the wrong way and seems to suggest, in fact, that I was suggesting that he was a crybaby. I didn't say that or intend it, but if the shoe fits, maybe he should wear it.

**Mr. Loewen:** Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** I saw you. Please be seated.

If this Assembly is expecting that the Speaker will be responsible for the facial expressions and views across the House, I think you provide a challenge to me and to any Speaker which goes far beyond the capacity of an individual to control. I think it rests with all of you.

Opposition House Leader, I've heard your two points of order. I think you have a motion you're proceeding with under Standing Order 42. Is that right, hon. member?

**Mr. Loewen:** Point of order.

### Point of Clarification

**Mr. Nixon:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on 13(2) to get you to explain your ruling on why you continue to allow the opposition to be abused and stand up for the majority in this House.

**The Speaker:** I've explained it, hon. member. We're done on that issue. Finished.

**Motions under Standing Order 42**

**The Speaker:** Now, are you prepared to move your motion? Would you please proceed with that.

**Trans Mountain Pipeline Construction Suspension**

Mr. Nixon:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the government not to proceed with any further increases to the carbon tax until Kinder Morgan's Trans Mountain expansion project has completed construction and commenced commercial operations.

**Mr. Nixon:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Again, we are 43 days, I believe, possibly 42 days, away from the Kinder Morgan imposed deadline on this Trans Mountain project. This government still has not taken any action on that. It still has the carbon tax, which they continue to raise and continue to punish everyday Albertans with in every sector, from veterans, seniors, schoolkids, on and on. They brutally and savagely punish them with this carbon tax and can't even get their social licence or their pipeline built. We believe that

they should suspend that at least until they can get their pipeline built and follow through on their promise to Albertans.

[Unanimous consent denied]

**The Speaker:** I believe the Routine for the day is complete.

Pursuant to Standing Order 59.01(5)(b) and the Budget 2018 main estimates schedule the House stands adjourned until tomorrow at 1:30 p.m. The legislative policy committees will convene this afternoon and tomorrow morning for consideration of the main estimates. This afternoon Families and Communities will consider the estimates for Education in the Parkland Room, and Alberta's Economic Future will consider the estimates for Executive Council in the Rocky Mountain Room. Tomorrow morning Resource Stewardship will consider the estimates for Municipal Affairs in the Rocky Mountain Room, and Families and Communities will consider the estimates for Children's Services in the Parkland Room.

[The Assembly adjourned at 3:06 p.m. pursuant to Standing Order 59.01(5)(b)]







## Table of Contents

Prayers .....	579
Introduction of Visitors .....	579
Introduction of Guests .....	579
Members' Statements	
Taber .....	580
Bow River Basin Council .....	580
Provincial Fiscal Position .....	581
Edmonton and Area Land Trust .....	581
Edgar Corbière .....	581
GoldenBucks Bakeshop in Edmonton-Meadowlark .....	590
Oral Question Period	
Provincial Response to Pipeline Opposition .....	582
Police Release of Information on Serious Incidents .....	582
Justice System Delays .....	583, 585
Legal Aid .....	583
Canadians' Views on Oil and Gas Transportation .....	584
Bill 12 .....	584
Carbon Levy Economic Impact .....	586
Southern Alberta Flooding .....	586
Electricity System .....	587
Health Care Accessibility .....	587
Small-business Economic Indicators .....	588
Water Act Enforcement .....	589
Flood Mitigation on the Bow River .....	589
Notices of Motions .....	590
Introduction of Bills	
Bill 14   An Act to Empower Utility Consumers .....	590
Tabling Returns and Reports .....	590
Tablings to the Clerk .....	591
Motions under Standing Order 42	
Trans Mountain Pipeline Construction Suspension .....	593

*Alberta Hansard* is available online at [www.assembly.ab.ca](http://www.assembly.ab.ca)

For inquiries contact:

Managing Editor

*Alberta Hansard*

3rd Floor, 9820 – 107 St

EDMONTON, AB T5K 1E7

Telephone: 780.427.1875